ILLINOIS POLLUTION CONTROL BOARD

PCB No-2013-027

(Citizens Enforcement – Air)

)

)

)

)

)

In the Matter of:

SIERRA CLUB

Complainant,

v.

MIDWEST GENERATION, LLC,

Respondent

APR 07 2017

RECEIVED

STATE OF ILLINOIS Pollution Control Board

NOTICE OF ELECTRONIC FILING

TO:

Don Brown, Clerk Bradley Halloran, Hearing Officer Illinois Pollution Control Board James R. Thompson Center 100 West Randolph, Suite 11-500 Chicago, Illinois 60601 don.brown@illinois.gov

David C. Bender McGillivray, Westerberg & Bender 211 S. Paterson Street, Suite 320 Madison, WI 53703 bender@mwbattorneys.com

Andrew N. Sawula Schiff Hardin LLP One Westminster Place Lake Forest, IL 60045 David L. Wentworth II Hasselberg, Williams, Grebe, Snodgrass & Birdsall 124 SW Adams, Suite 360 Peoria, IL 61602-1320 dwentworth@hwgsb.com

Sean P. Williams Goldstein & McClintock, LLP 208 S. LaSalle Street Suite 1750 Chicago, IL 60601

Stephen J. Bonebrake Bina Joshi Schiff Hardin LLP 233 South Wacker Drive Suite 6600 Chicago, Illinois 60606

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that on this date I filed electronically with the Office of the Clerk of the Pollution Control Board of the State of Illinois the attached **Joint Motion to Dismiss Without Prejudice** and **Stipulation on Costs and Fees**, copies of which are herewith served upon you. Dated: 6th April, 2017

Respectfully Submitted,

Jaith E. Bugel

Faith E. Bugel Attorney at Law 1004 Mohawk Wilmette, IL 60091 (312) 282-9119

BEFORE THE ILLINOIS POLLUTION CONTROL BOARD

)

)

In the Matter of:
SIERRA CLUB
Complainant,
V.
MIDWEST GENERATION, LLC,

Respondent

PCB No-2013-027 (Citizens Enforcement – Air) CLERK'S OFFICE

STATE OF ILLINOIS Pollution Control Board

PARTIES' JOINT MOTION TO DISMISS WITHOUT PREJUDICE

Pursuant to Section 101.500(a) of the Pollution Control Board General Rules, Complainant Sierra Club, Inc., and Respondent Midwest Generation, LLC ("MWG") (collectively, the "Parties") jointly move the Illinois Pollution Control Board ("Board") to dismiss the Complaint in this action without prejudice. In support of this motion, the Parties state as follows:

1. On December 15, 2012, Complainant filed a Complaint relating to four MWG power stations: the Joliet Generating Station in Will County, Illinois (the "Joliet Station"); the Powerton Generating Station in Tazewell County, Illinois (the "Powerton Station"); the Waukegan Generating Station in Lake County, Illinois (the "Waukegan Station"); and the Will County Generating Station in Will County, Illinois (the "Will County Station") (collectively, the "Stations"). (Compl. Par. 3.)

 The Complaint contains two counts, both of which are premised on the 2010 1hour SO₂ National Ambient Air Quality Standard (the "1-hour SO₂ NAAQS"). (Compl. ¶ 31-34.) The first count alleges that the Stations violate the Illinois Environmental Protection Act § 9(a) by emitting SO₂ air pollution that causes ambient air quality to exceed the 1-hour SO₂ NAAQS. (Compl. ¶ 32.) The second count alleges that the Stations violate 35 IAC § 201.141, and consequently Section 9(a), "by emitting or threatening to emit SO₂ into the environment in amounts that, either alone or in combination with contaminants from other sources, prevent the attainment or maintenance of the 1-hour SO₂ NAAQS" (Compl. ¶ 34.), MWG denies the allegations.

After the complaint was filed, the State of Illinois took several actions in relation 3. to the 1-hour SO₂ NAAQS. First, on April 28, 2015, the Illinois Environmental Protection Agency ("IEPA") initiated a rulemaking action before the Board, "Amendments to 35 ILL. Adm. Code Part 214, Sulfur Limitations, Part 217, Nitrogen Oxides Emissions, and Part 225, Control of Emissions from Large Combustion Sources" pertaining to areas designated as nonattainment with respect to the 1-hour SO₂ NAAQS for the purpose, among others, of "satisfy[ing] Illinois' obligation to submit a State Implementation Plan . . . to the United States Environmental Protection Agency . . . regarding these nonattainment areas." (PCB R15-21, Statement of Reasons, at 1 (Apr. 28, 2015).) The SO₂ nonattainment areas addressed by this rulemaking were comprised of the Lemont nonattainment area ("NAA"), which includes part of Cook County (Lemont Township) and part of Will County (DuPage and Lockport Townships), and the Pekin NAA, which includes part of Tazewell County (Cincinnati and Pekin Townships) and part of Peoria County (Hollis Township). 40 CFR § 81.314. The Will County Station and the Joliet Station are located in or near the Lemont NAA, and the Powerton Station is located in the Pekin NAA. Subsequently, the State adopted these rules (PCB R15-21, Notice of Adopted Rulemaking; 51 Ill. Reg. Vol. 39, at 16174 (Dec. 18, 2015)), and submitted them as the Nonattainment State Implementation Plan for the 1-hour SO2 NAAQS to U.S. EPA for approval. 81 Fed. Reg. 14736, 14737 (Mar. 18, 2016).

4. Second, the IEPA recommended to the U.S. EPA that Lake County, Illinois, the county in which the Waukegan plant is located, be designated attainment. This recommendation was supported by air quality characterization documentation that included modeling and was required by U.S. EPA's 1-Hour SO₂ NAAQS rulemaking. (Ex. A, Letter from Alec Messina, Acting Director, IEPA, to Robert Kaplan, Acting Regional Administrator, U.S. EPA Region V (Jan. 12, 2017)).

5. U.S. EPA has not made a final decision on either of these submittals and, as a result, it is not possible to ascertain how any U.S. EPA decision will impact on Complainant's claims, if at all. Further, even though U.S EPA's review of the State submittals is pending, the duration of that review is uncertain. In these circumstances, the benefits of continuing to delay this case for the purpose of awaiting additional action by the regulators are outweighed by the burden on the Parties and the Board of maintaining this proceeding over an extended time frame. Thus, in the interest of efficiency, the Parties agree to a voluntary dismissal of Complainant's claims without prejudice.

6. The Parties agree, per the attached stipulation, that each Party is to bear its own costs, expenses and fees related to this matter.

CONCLUSION

For these reasons, the Parties respectfully request that this Board grant this motion and dismiss the Complaint without prejudice, each party to bear its own costs, expenses and fees related to this matter.

Respectfully submitted,

SIERRA CLUB

MIDWEST GENERATION, LLC

By: Jaith E. Bugel

Faith E. Bugel

Faith E. Bugel Attorney at Law 1004 Mohawk Rd. Wilmette, IL 60091 (312) 282-9119

By:

One of Its Attorneys

Stephen J. Bonebrake Bina Joshi Schiff Hardin LLP 233 South Wacker Drive Suite 6600 Chicago, IL 60606 (312) 258-5500

Andrew N. Sawula Schiff Hardin LLP One Westminster Place Lake Forest, IL 60045 (847) 295-4336

BEFORE THE ILLINOIS POLLUTION CONTROL BOARD

)

In the Matter of:

SIERRA CLUB

Complainant,

v.

MIDWEST GENERATION, LLC,

Respondent

PCB No-2013-027 (Citizens Enforcement – Air)

STIPULATION ON COSTS AND FEES

IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED by and between Complainant and

Respondent that each party is to bear its own costs, expenses and attorneys' fees related to this matter.

Respectfully submitted,

SIERRA CLUB

MIDWEST GENERATION, LLC

By:

Faith C. Bugel

Faith E. Bugel

By:

One of Its Attorneys

Faith E. Bugel	Stephen J. Bonebrake
Attorney at Law	Bina Joshi
1004 Mohawk Rd.	Schiff Hardin LLP
Wilmette, IL 60091	233 South Wacker Drive Suite 6600
(312) 282-9119	Chicago, IL 60606
	(312) 258-5500
The second	Andrew N. Sawula
	Schiff Hardin LLP
	One Westminster Place
2. And a shadoot is the characteristic state of the second stat	Lake Forest, IL 60045
(many 1 - Con B) (C - B) (C - D) (C - C) (C -	(847) 295-4336

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, the undersigned, certify that I have served on the date of <u>6th April, 2017</u> the attached **Joint Motion to Dismiss Without Prejudice** and **Stipulation on Costs and Fees**, upon the following persons by electronic mail/U.S. Mail/FedEx, with proper postage or delivery charges prepaid:

(a) Consents to email service

PCB 2013-027 @ Stephen J. Bonebrake Schiff Hardin, LLP 6600 Willis Tower 233 S. Wacker Drive Chicago, IL 60606-6473

PCB 2013-027 David C. Bender McGillivray, Westerberg & Bender, LLC 211 S. Paterson Street Suite 320 Madison, WI 53703

PCB 2013-027 David L. Wentworth II Hasselberg, Williams, Grebe, Snodgrass & Birdsall 124 SW Adams, Suite 360 Peoria, IL 61602-1320 PCB 2013-027 @ Bina Joshi Schiff Hardin, LLP 6600 Willis Tower 233 S. Wacker Drive Chicago, IL 60606-6473

PCB 2013-027 @ Andrew N. Sawula Schiff Hardin, LLP 6600 Willis Tower 233 S. Wacker Drive Chicago, IL 60606-6473

PCB 2013-027 Sean P. Williams Goldstein & McClintock, LLP 208 S. LaSalle Street Suite 1750 Chicago, IL 60601

Respectfully Submitted,

Akriti Bhargava Litigation Assistant Sierra Club 2101 Webster St., Suite 1300 Oakland, CA – 94612 415-977-5629 akriti.bhargava@sierraclub.org